DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 474 278 CE 084 637

TITLE	Women and Career Development. Symposium.
REPORT NO	No-1
PUB DATE	2002-00-00
NOTE	26p.; In: Academy of Human Resource Development (AHRD) Conference Proceedings (Honolulu, Hawaii, February 27-March 3, 2002); see CE 084 635.
PUB TYPE	Information Analyses (070) -- Reports - Research (143) -- Speeches/Meeting Papers (150)
EDRS PRICE	EDRS Price MF01/PC02 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS	Adult Education; *Affective Behavior; *Career Development; Career Education; College Faculty; Developing Nations; Emotional Intelligence; Emotional Response; *Employed Women; Females; Foreign Countries; Higher Education; Human Resources; *Labor Force Development; Literature Reviews; *Mentors; Professional Development; *Reentry Workers; Sex Differences; Stopouts; Womens Education
IDENTIFIERS	*Koreans

ABSTRACT

Three papers comprise this symposium on women and career development. "Enhancing the Career Success of Women Faculty: Mentoring as a Human Resource Development (HRD) Initiative in Higher Education" (Sharon K. Gibson) explores mentoring of women faculty, focusing on the key dimensions of roles and functions, outcomes, gender, and formal and informal mentorships. It suggests the need for the HRD profession to assume an integral role in advancing research on mentoring and other career development initiatives for women in higher education. "Emotions in Women's Career Development: A Merging of Literatures" (Rose Opengart, Laura Bierema) is a critical review of the literatures of emotional intelligence, emotion work, and women's career development that was conducted to examine relationships, similarities, and differences between emotions and women's learning and career development. Common themes are identified, future research questions are posed, and implications for women and organizations are drawn. "The Meaning of Korean Women's Experience of Reentering the Workforce" (Yu-Jin Lee, Gary N. McLean) reports a qualitative study of the experiences of reentry women using phenomenology that identified seven themes: giving up the fantasy of becoming a happy homemaker; feeling not welcomed; first come, first served; feeling empowered; feeling guilty; being vulnerable to the patriarchal workplace culture; and redefining one's meaning of work. All papers contain substantial references. (YLB)

Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made
from the original document.

ED 474 278

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Gibson/Opengart/Lee

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

1

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

2002 AHRD Conference

Women and Career Development

Symposium 1

Honolulu, Hawaii

February 27 - March 3, 2002

CE084 637

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Enhancing the Career Success of Women Faculty: Mentoring as a HRD Initiative in Higher Education

Sharon K. Gibson
University of St. Thomas

Mentoring has been suggested as a strategy to promote gender equity for women faculty and to enhance their career development. This paper explores mentoring of women faculty, focusing on the key dimensions of roles and functions, outcomes, gender, and formal and informal mentorships. The review suggests the need for the HRD profession to assume an integral role in advancing research on mentoring and other career development initiatives for women in higher education.

Keywords: Mentoring, Women Faculty, Career Development

Although women have made significant gains in entering faculty positions over the past two decades, status inequities and disparities in major indicators of professional status—rank, salary, tenure, job satisfaction, and working conditions—continue to exist for academic women across a variety of institutional categories and types. The proportion of women has grown much faster at lower ranks than among senior faculty and, overall, women remain underrepresented in the academic ranks in proportion to their fraction in society (Bentley & Blackburn, 1992; Glazer-Raymo, 1999). In addition, a number of reports suggest that gender discrimination continues to be prevalent in many of our academic institutions. A recent *Women in Higher Education* publication identified four separate reports of bias against female faculty at Stanford University, noting that in February 1999 the U.S. Department of Labor began investigating complaints by 32 women and minorities, including 15 former and current faculty, who stated that they were denied tenure or promotion or fired because of their gender ("Is Stanford University Hostile," 2000). As noted by Hopkins (1999), a professor of biology at Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT), "Together, the messages suggest that gender bias is widespread in academe....At the White House, where I listened to women who work in diverse occupations, I learned that the problem may be universal in the workplace" (p. B5).

In exploring issues facing women in higher education with an objective of shaping a national agenda, the University of Minnesota 'Women's Voices, Women's Lives, Women's Solutions' National Teleconference Program Committee (1999) noted that equity remains an elusive goal, suggesting the need for continued and revitalized activism in the twenty-first century. Although there is recognition of the need to provide support to women in higher education, the culture of academia and the proportionately fewer women in positions of power makes this a more difficult agenda to fulfill. As stated by Johnetta Cole, the first African-American female president of Spelman College, now presidential distinguished Professor of Anthropology, Women's Studies and African American Studies at Emory University:

> Mentoring could help, but it's less available to those who aren't mainstream white males. The demands on women or minority faculty to mentor are intense. Most do this essential work generously, then find it ignored by those who evaluate them for promotion or tenure. ("Social Change Requires," 2000, p. 2)

In looking at the institutional practices that influence career opportunities for women in higher education, Watkins, Gillaspie, & Bullard (1996) state that, although more women have been granted entrance to higher education, there are few institutional incentives in place to encourage their long-term success in positions of prestige and authority. In addition, according to the American Faculty Poll, a nationwide survey of 1,512 full-time faculty at two and four year institutions, women reported being less content with their jobs than did men faculty (Sanderson, Phua, & Herda, 2000). Simply put, a recent *Women in Higher Education* newsletter had the following headline: "Their Jobs Could be Better, Female Profs Report" (2000, p. 20).

Statement of the Problem

The various perspectives in the literature indicate that the experience of women faculty in adjusting to their professional roles is particularly challenging in a system where men occupy the majority of tenured positions and where women have less access to informal information networks. Issues for women in academia span the academic lifecycle, affecting both those new to academia (junior faculty) as well as women in tenured positions. Faculty members often experience a rude awakening upon entrance into the academic environment and the experience of

Copyright © 2002 Sharon K. Gibson

faculty is frequently described as fraught with difficulties and reflective of a chilly academic climate (Boice, 1991, 1993; Hamrick, 1998; Struthers, 1995; Whitt, 1991). Many faculty experience significant difficulties in adjusting to the varying demands of the academic role. These adjustment issues may be more prevalent among women than men, as women are perceived to have less access to sources of information and support in organizations and have historically been engaged in positions of lesser status (Maitland, 1990). And although women are entering academia, they have a success rate less than that of men and continue to be underrepresented in tenured faculty positions (Bentley & Blackburn, 1992; Glazer-Raymo, 1999; Hensel, 1991).

In addition, a recent study of women faculty in science at MIT emphasized the need to specifically study the experience of women faculty, not only as it relates to new faculty, but over the course of women faculty members' careers. This study found that the percentage of women faculty from 1985 to 1994 in the School of Science (approximately 8% female) had not increased significantly over this 10-year period. Subsequent interviews with tenured faculty found that these women reported increased marginalization as they progressed through their careers. Despite professional accomplishments equal to their male colleagues, women faculty received less salary, space, awards, and resources ("A Study on the Status of Women Faculty," 1999). A decade prior, Aisenberg and Harrington (1988) studied both women faculty who had deflected off the career track and those who were tenured and found similar themes of professional marginalism and exclusion. This study revealed a "continuum of outsiderness" in the experiences of both groups of women (p. xii). Watkins et al. (1996) also emphasized the nature of women faculty as 'outsiders' and identified that women continued to feel isolated and constrained by the existing structure or due to outside responsibilities. In addition, they noted that, although there is frequently no one to assist women faculty in gaining access to the organizational systems necessary for success, many women have not actively sought a mentor to provide this assistance. "In sum, cultural, attitudinal, and structural constraints inhibit women's progress" (Glazer-Raymo, 1999, p. 198).

So, is mentoring an effective human resource development strategy for academic women? In interviews with women faculty, Aisenberg and Harrington (1988) noted the following: "In story after story, then, the factor of support—received or not received—appears to be critical to the course of a woman's professional development" (p. 50). Similarly, the lack of pre-established mentoring and social networks was identified by Boice (1993) as indicative of maladaptive starts or 'early career fault lines' for women and minority faculty. Wheeler and Wheeler (1994) noted that adult development occurs throughout a faculty member's career lifecycle and that mentoring can assist with this process of continued growth. As such, mentoring is described as applicable for new faculty in both their roles as teachers and scholars (Jackson & Simpson, 1994; Johnsrud, 1994) and for faculty experiencing mid-career issues (Wheeler & Wheeler, 1994). In addition, the potential benefits of mentoring for women may be more significant than for men, as it has been suggested that women's learning and development is more rooted in relationships (Bloom, 1995; Gilligan, 1982). Mentoring may, therefore, be of greater value to women in their struggle to succeed in their roles as faculty members over the academic lifecycle.

A critical role of HRD is to support initiatives that foster employee contribution so as to contribute to organizational performance. As noted by McDonald and Hite (1998), "The historic and continuing function of HRD has been to maximize employee potential to contribute to overall organizational strength. This role clearly justifies involvement in women's career progress and interest in the ramifications of inadequate support for women in organizations" (p. 54). These authors further identify mentoring as a key HRD initiative and state that the HRD function might well be considered a natural place for the development of mentoring initiatives due to HRD's role in fostering career development aligned with the needs of the organization.

Given the potential of these types of relationships to positively influence both the development of women faculty and their resulting contribution to the organization, a review of the key dimensions of mentoring for women faculty in higher education, including the roles and functions of mentoring, mentoring outcomes, gender and mentoring functions, and informal and formal mentorships, appears warranted. This mentoring literature will be traced from early developmental theorists to current perspectives, focusing on the application to the career development of women faculty.

Mentoring in Higher Education

Theoretical Framework

Although social learning theory represents the theoretical framework for some articles on mentoring in education (Thompson, 1990; St. Clair, 1994), there is more emphasis in the education literature on the conceptual framework provided by adult development theory and on aspects specific to women's adult and psychological development. Levinson was one of the first adult development theorists to conceptualize the mentoring relationship

in a classical sense and as crucial to the overall development of the young adult (Levinson, Darrow, Klein, Levinson, & McBee, 1978). Vaillant (1977) supported the importance of mentoring in adult development in his longitudinal study of 95 male Harvard graduates. He found that the most successful men had been both protégés in a mentoring relationship and mentors to others. In Erikson's stages of psychosocial development, mentoring was identified as part of the developmental stage of 'generativity'. In this stage, individuals in mid-adulthood begin to feel a need to provide support and guidance to the next generation (as cited in Bee & Bjorklund, 2000). Other adult development writers such as Sheehy (1976) explored women's life patterns. Sheehy noted that women who had received recognition in their careers had engaged in a mentoring relationship.

In looking at women's adult development, Gilligan (1982) proposed that women's identity development, rather than being independent, should be considered as interdependent. According to Gilligan, relationships and caring are central concepts for women's adult development and that, when women engage in the adult milieu, "the world of relationship emerges and becomes the focus of attention and concern" (p. 167). In discussing women's ways of knowing, Belenky, Clinchy, Goldberger, and Tarule (1986) identified the importance of allowing women's voices to develop and be heard. Kegan (1982) drew from constructive-developmental psychology in describing development as a series of emergences from and relationships with "cultures of embeddedness" (p. 118). These can include parents, families, schools, institutions, and mentors. The culture, then, supports women rooting their identities in their relationships (Kegan, 1982). Specific to women in higher education, Johnsrud (1991) proposed that the orientation of women toward connectedness and interdependence is fundamental to understanding the growth and development of participants in a mentoring relationship.

These perspectives on women's adult and psychological development would suggest that the different orientation of women influences the nature of the mentoring relationship. As noted, the emphasis in this literature was on individual development, with very little focus on issues of organizational effectiveness. However, Johnsrud (1991) proposed that the establishment of mentoring relationships in keeping with these principles could enhance collaboration across the academic environment, and thus has the potential to contribute to both individual and organizational success.

Mentoring Roles and Functions

Mentoring roles and functions in the higher education literature were conceptualized in various ways. In their discussion of administrative mentoring, Anderson and Ramey (1990) described the role functions of educator, sponsor, coach, counselor, and confronter. An educator shares knowledge about the organization; a sponsor widens the protégé's exposure in the organization; a coach is responsible for the protégé's affective, cognitive, and psychomotor skill development; a counselor listens, advises, supports and encourages problem solving; and a confronter helps the protégé with identifying alternatives and consequences. In one of the larger studies of 347 faculty members stratified by rank and gender, Sands, Parson, and Duane (1991) performed a factor analysis on mentoring functions and identified four kinds of mentor roles: the friend (included providing advice and emotional support, participation in social activities, and defense from criticism); the career guide (included collaboration in research and professional networking/visibility); the information source (included providing information about the organization, both formal and informal); and the intellectual guide (included intellectual guidance and feedback). The complexity and multidimensional aspects of mentoring in higher education were apparent based on this research.

A number of authors have addressed the multiple roles of the mentor in the educational setting in supporting women's adult development. Bloom (1995) described the different ways that mentors stand in relationship to protégés (behind, ahead, face-to-face, and beside), positing that learning and human development for women is based in relationships. Similar to Gilligan's (1982) perspective on women's adult development, Bloom described mentoring as an expression of 'care' in helping protégés develop. Based on the work of Kegan (1982), Johnsrud (1991) proposed a conceptual framework for mentoring that incorporates values of affiliation, caring and interdependence. She described three stages of the mentoring process in academia as follows: the dependent stage (where the protégé needs guidance within the academic culture and where it is difficult to distinguish oneself outside of the relationship); the independent stage (characterized by the protégé reclaiming the sense of self as authority and differentiating oneself from the relationship) and finally, the interdependent stage (where there is the potential for both parties to maintain connectedness and separate identities). The roles and stages proposed by these authors were more grounded in the process aspects of the relationship than the functions that the relationship could provide, again supporting the predominant focus on individual development issues.

Outcomes of Mentoring

Studies of mentoring in higher education indicated that support and sponsorship contributed to faculty vitality and career success (Baldwin, 1990; Cameron & Blackburn, 1981; Corcoran & Clark, 1984; Henderson & Welch, 1993) and that the lack of pre-established mentorships and social networks contributed to a maladaptive start in one's academic career (Boice, 1993). However, it was unclear from these studies as to how sponsorship might be conceived as being either different or similar to mentoring. Williams and Blackburn (1988) studied faculty mentoring in eight nursing colleges and found that, of the potential mentoring types of role-specific modeling/teaching, encouraging, organizational socialization, and advocate, only role-specific modeling/teaching was related to the protégés' research productivity. In conceptualizing mentoring of faculty in academia, O'Leary and Mitchell (1990) emphasized the importance of reciprocity of benefits in a mentoring relationship, which would indicate that the relationship needs to be structured so that both mentors and protégés accrue certain benefits. A recent study by Mullen, Van Ast, and Grant (1999) of 165 faculty mentors and 166 faculty protégés supported this concept, in that those mentors who provided vocational and psychosocial functions for protégés also reported receiving greater benefits as mentors. Stalker (1994) also emphasized this notion of reciprocity in academia and discussed the outcomes of career advancement, personal development and professional identification as characteristic of an ideal mentoring relationship in academia from both the perspective of the mentor and protégé.

In their study of 220 agricultural education faculty, Eastman and Williams (1993) found that mentoring was not related to the majority of career development indicators included in the study. However, participants who experienced higher levels of mentoring felt more satisfied with their jobs and career progress. Hill, Bahniuk, & Dobos (1989) studied 224 faculty and also found that mentored faculty experienced increased job satisfaction and communicative support. With respect to performance scores on an academic career success index comprised of income, number of journal articles and book chapters, and faculty rank, these researchers found that both mentored and non-mentored male faculty received higher scores than mentored female faculty and that non-mentored female faculty had the lowest scores. Based on these results, the researchers concluded that while mentoring is helpful to both genders in academia, being male is more helpful in terms of overall career success indicators.

Gender and Mentoring Functions

Although based on the literature on women's adult development one might expect to see differences in mentoring functions in higher education based on gender, the findings of the studies reviewed do not support any strong conclusions. Mullen et al. (1999) found that female faculty mentors reported greater mentoring benefits, but the gender mix of the relationships did not seem to matter. Sands et al. (1991) found no significant differences in the quantity of mentoring experiences of the men and women in their study. However, a study by Noe (1988) of mentors and protégés in a formal mentoring program for educators did show some gender effects with mentors in cross-gender relationships reporting that protégés utilized the relationship more effectively than those in same-gender relationships and that females in general utilized the relationship more effectively than males.

However, factors other than gender may have a greater influence on the efficacy of mentoring relationships in the academic environment. Struthers (1995) studied 165 female professors who had been mentored and found that a key factor related to the utilization of power to support protégés' academic careers was the rank of the professor, regardless of gender. Johnsrud (1991) also discussed various problems with traditional mentoring conceptualizations in academia that had more to do with imbalance of power than with gender. These studies indicated that, possibly due to the hierarchy and power structures of academia, the mentor's rank may be an important consideration in mentoring relationships.

A number of articles also addressed the specific needs that people of color, especially African-American women, have in attaining leadership roles in education and in achieving success in academia. Mentoring and the development of personal and professional networks were identified as important in providing personal and emotional support to African-American women faculty and in assisting these faculty with negotiating institutional politics (Bowie, 1995; Peterson, 1990; Reid, 1990).

Informal and Formal Mentorships

Mentoring in past years appeared to have been more informal in higher education, with these relationships predominantly being established based on mutual negotiation between the parties (Sands et al., 1991). A study by Noe (1988) pointed to the difficulty of assessing these programs, due to the varying types of relationships that could be either negotiated or facilitated by the educational institution. In studying the determinants of successful assigned

mentoring relationships, Noe (1988) studied 43 mentors and 139 protégés engaged in a formal mentoring program designed to promote the personal and career development of educators aspiring to attain administrative positions. He found that protégés reported receiving beneficial psychosocial outcomes but limited career functions as a result of participation in the program. He suggested that mentoring relationships that provide both career and psychosocial functions were more reflective of the classical or primary definition of mentoring. These primary relationships were characterized by high levels of commitment on the part of both mentor and protégé and were perceived to have a higher impact on the individual's personal development. Therefore, according to Noe (1988), assigned mentoring relationships should not be expected to have the same benefits as that of a primary or classical relationship. In addition, those relationships that provided career functions were likely to be beneficial for instrumental reasons but were characterized as less intimate. Noe also noted that there might be individual-level variables not included in the study that could have a potent influence on the success of mentoring relationships, such as the individual's level of self-efficacy.

Notwithstanding the lack of clarity of research in education on mentoring outcomes of formal and informal relationships, there was a significant amount of literature recommending the establishment of formal mentoring programs in educational settings. A number of articles addressed the establishment of faculty mentoring programs as a component of faculty development (DiLorenzo & Heppner, 1994; Sorcinelli, 1994; St. Clair, 1994). Other articles suggested programs and strategies for mentoring junior faculty (Borisoff, 1997; Henry, Stockdale, Hall, & Deniston, 1994), outlined specific mentoring models or standards (Dagenais, 1997; Pistole, 1994), and discussed options for beginning teachers (Abell, Dillon, Hopkins, McInerney, & O'Brien, 1995; Ballantyne, Hansford, & Packer, 1995; Williams, 2001). This literature predominantly focused on illuminating mentor roles and functions and discussed benefits and limitations of these programs. Although potential negatives to mentoring including protégé dependency and inattentiveness, erratic behavior, inconsistencies on the part of the mentor, and lack of mentor competence were discussed by a number of authors (Anderson & Ramsey, 1990; Braun, 1990; Ballantyne et al., 1995), these programs were commonly viewed as having positive outcomes for both the mentor and protégé. However, specifics on program implementation and benefits of these programs tended to be based more on anecdotal information than on formal evaluation data. As St. Clair (1994) notes: "Community college administrators and faculty must realize the importance of documenting and evaluating existing mentoring programs" (p. 32).

Conclusions: Mentoring in Higher Education

The framework for a number of the studies and reviews in higher education was adult development theory, with an emphasis on processes and programs specific to women and minorities. The roles of mentoring in higher education were conceptualized quite broadly and tended to be process-oriented. Much of the literature focused on issues of individual development, with little attention paid to organizational implications such as gender equity or the achievement of organizational performance objectives.

Although there was general agreement that support and sponsorship contributed to faculty success, only a tentative conclusion could be made with respect to mentoring being related to outcomes such as job satisfaction and the various indexes of academic career progress. There was some indication that women utilized the mentoring relationship more effectively than men and may have gained greater benefits; however, a potential key factor to be considered in these relationships was the academic rank of the mentor, irrespective of gender. It was suggested that assigned mentoring relationships may be less reflective of the classical or primary mentorship role and, therefore, may not produce the same breadth of outcomes as those that are informally established. There was a high level of interest in implementing formal mentoring programs as a HRD initiative in higher education settings; however, not much was known about their effectiveness. Although mentoring programs were generally perceived positively, the need for better program evaluation to guide the development of these programs was identified.

Implications and Recommendations for Human Resource Development

Given the identified need to address issues of status and equity for women faculty, the expectations for positive outcomes of mentoring as a HRD initiative in higher education were high. Mentoring was suggested as a development strategy that had the potential to contribute to the ultimate career success of faculty and to assist in their socialization and orientation. In the literature, programs and practices specific to women in the academic environment were emphasized. For women, mentoring was suggested as a strategy to promote gender equity and as a means to enhance career development in the academic institution. Furthermore, mentoring has been noted as a key HRD initiative for women in terms of its role in leveling the playing field (McDonald & Hite, 1998).

However, this review pointed to the lack of clarity in the literature as to how mentoring can be utilized as a human resource development strategy to help women to achieve career success in their academic institutions. In general, the literature base for mentoring in higher education tended to be more conceptual than research-based. There was insufficient, and at times inconclusive, information with respect to certain key dimensions of mentoring in higher education, including outcomes, gender, and the relative efficacy of formal or informal mentorships, to know what exactly to recommend or what types of mentoring are likely to have an impact on issues of status and career progression.

It is important, however, that we not ignore the substantial support that mentoring has from practitioners in the education field. This support from those who wish to utilize this approach as a HRD initiative to promote gender equity/access and to enhance career development of women faculty would suggest the need to focus additional HRD research on this area. Based on the emphasis in the higher education literature on individual development, it seems apparent that there is a great opportunity for the HRD profession to become more engaged in advancing research on mentoring and other career development initiatives in the higher education context. It is likely that the educational institutions for whom these faculty work would also have an interest in the connection of these HRD initiatives to organizational outcomes. In addition, a number of authors describe complicating factors associated with mentoring of women that focus on issues of workplace culture and power relationships (Hansman, 1998; Schramm, 2000), which fall readily within the realm and interests of HRD.

As noted by Mullen, Steffy, and Van Ast (2001) in their study of mentors in the education context, the literature on mentoring is still in its infancy. Given the need to find ways to improve the experience and adjustment of women faculty so as to enhance their likelihood of career success and ultimately, their contribution to organizational success, enhanced integration of HRD research would likely provide beneficial outcomes and support the development of a more inclusive mentoring model for academic women.

References

Abell, S. K., Dillon, D. R., Hopkins, C. J., McInerney, W. D., & O'Brien, D. G. (1995). Somebody to count on: Mentor/intern relationships in a beginning teacher internship program. *Teacher and Teacher Education, 11*(2), 173-188.

Aisenberg, N., & Harrington, M. (1988). *Women of academe: Outsiders in the sacred grove*, Amherst, MA: The University of Massachusetts Press.

Anderson, R. T., & Ramey, R. (1990). Women in higher education: Development through administrative mentoring. In L. B. Welsch (Ed.), *Women in higher education: Changes and challenges* (pp. 183-190). New York: Praeger.

Baldwin, R. G. (1990). Faculty vitality beyond the research university: Extending a contextual concept. *Journal of Higher Education, 61*(2), 160-180.

Ballantyne, R., Hansford, B., & Packer, J. (1995). Mentoring beginning teachers: A qualitative analysis of process and outcomes. *Educational Review, 47*(3), 297-307.

Bee, H. L., & Bjorklund, B. R. (2000). *The journey of adulthood* (4th ed.). Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice-Hall, Inc.

Belenky, M. F., Clinchy, B. M., Goldberger, N. R., & Tarule, J. M. (1986). *Women's ways of knowing: The development of self, voice, and mind.* New York: Basic Books, Inc.

Bentley. R. J., & Blackburn, R. T. (1992). Two decades of gain for female faculty? *Teachers College Record, 93*(4), 697-709.

Bloom, M. (1995). Multiple roles of the mentor supporting women's adult development. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education, 65*, 63-72.

Boice, R. (1991). New faculty as teachers. *Journal of Higher Education, 62*(2), 150-173.

Boice, R. (1993). Early turning points in professorial careers of women and minorities. *New Directions for Teaching and Learning, 53*, 71-79.

Borisoff, D. (1997, April). *Strategies for effective mentoring and for being effectively mentored: A focus on Ph.D.-granting private research institutions*, Paper presented at the annual meeting of the Eastern Communication Association, Baltimore, MD. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 411 566)

Bowie, M. M. (1995). African American female faculty at large research universities: Their need for information. *Innovative Higher Education, 19*(4), 269-276.

Braun, R. (1990). The downside of mentoring. In L. B. Welsch (Ed.), *Women in higher education: Changes and challenges* (pp. 191-198). New York: Praeger.

Cameron, S. W., & Blackburn, R. T. (1981). Sponsorship and academic career success. *Journal of Higher*

Education, 52(4), 369-377.
Corcoran, M., & Clark, S. M. (1984). Professional socialization and contemporary career attitudes of three faculty generations. *Research in Higher Education, 20*(2), 131-153.
Dagenais, R. J. (1997, December). *Mentoring program standards: Mentoring*. Paper presented at the annual conference of the National Staff Development Council, Nashville, TN. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 419 776)
DiLorenzo, T. M., & Heppner, P. P. (1994). The role of an academic department in promoting faculty development: Recognizing diversity and leading to excellence. *Journal of Counseling and Development, 72*(19), 485-491.
Eastman, K., & Williams, D. L. (1993). Relationship between mentoring and career development of agricultural education faculty. *Journal of Agricultural Education, 34*(2), 71-76.
Gilligan, C. (1982). *In a different voice: Psychological theory and women's development*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
Glazer-Raymo, J. (1999). *Shattering the myths: Women in academe*. Baltimore, MD: The Johns Hopkins University Press.
Hamrick, F. A. (1998, April). *"I have work to do": Affirmation and marginalization of women full professors*. Paper presented at the annual meeting of the American Educational Research Association. San Diego: CA (ERIC Document Reproduction Service ED 420 251)
Hansman, C. A. (1998). Mentoring and women's career development. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education, 80*, 63-71.
Henderson, J., & Welch, O. M. (1993, April). *Mentoring in higher education and industry: Is there a paradox?* Paper presented at the American Educational Research Association, Atlanta, GA. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 363 179).
Henry, J. S., Stockdale, M. S., Hall, M., & Deniston, W. (1994). A formal mentoring program for junior female faculty: Description and evaluation. *Initiatives, 56*(2), 37-45.
Hensel, N. (1991). *Realizing gender equality in higher education: The need to integrate work/family issues.* (ASHE-ERIC Higher Education Report 2). Washington, DC: Office of Educational Research and Improvement.
Hill, S. E. K., Bahniuk, M. H., & Dobos, J. (1989). The impact of mentoring and collegial support on faculty success: An analysis of support behavior, information adequacy, and communication apprehension. *Communication Education, 38*, 15-33.
Hopkins, N. (1999, June 11). MIT and gender bias: Following up on victory. *The Chronicle of Higher Education 45*(40), B4-5.
Is Stanford University hostile to women faculty? (2000, May). *Women in Higher Education, 9*(5), 23.
Jackson, W. K., & Simpson, R. D. (1994). Mentoring new faculty for teaching and research. *New Directions for Teaching and Learning, 57*, 65-72.
Johnsrud, L. K. (1991). Mentoring between academic women: The capacity for interdependence. *Initiatives, 54*(3), 7-17.
Johnsrud, L. K. (1994). Enabling the success of junior faculty women through mentoring. *New Directions for Teaching and Learning, 57*, 53-64.
Kegan, R. (1982). *The evolving self: Problems and process in human development*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
Levinson, D. J., Darrow, C. N., Klein, E. B., Levinson, M. H., & McKee B. (1978). *The seasons of a man's life.* New York: Ballantine Books.
Maitland, C. (1990). The inequitable treatment of women faculty in higher education. In L. B. Welsch (Ed.), *Women in higher education: Changes and challenges* (pp. 246-254). New York: Praeger.
McDonald, K. S., & Hite, L. M. (1998). Human resource development's role in women's career progress. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education, 80*, 53-62.
Mullen, E. J., Van Ast, J., & Grant, H. (1999). Mentoring as a tool for faculty development: Predicting positive outcomes for mentors. In K. P. Kuchinke (Ed.), *Proceedings of the Academy of Human Resource Development*, Arlington, VA: AHRD.
Mullen, E. J., Steffy, B. E., & Van Ast, J. (2001). The career life cycle and mentoring: The opportunity for reflection as an outcome for mentors. In O. A. Aliaga (Ed.), *Proceedings of the Academy of Human Resource Development*, Tulsa, OK: AHRD.
Noe, R. A. (1988). An investigation of the determinants of successful assigned mentoring relationships. *Personnel Psychology, 41*, 457-479.

O'Leary, V. E., & Mitchell, J. M. (1990). Women connecting with women: Networks and mentors. In S. S. Lie & V. E. O'Leary (Eds.), *Storming the tower: Women in the academic world* (pp. 58-73). New York: Nichols/G. P. Publishing.

Peterson, S. (1990). Challenges for black women faculty. *Initiatives, 53*(1), 33-36.

Pistole, M. C. (1994). Mentoring women's academic careers: Using a family model to enhance women's success. *Initiatives, 56*(2), 29-36.

Reid, P. T. (1990). African-American women in academia: Paradoxes and barriers. In S. S. Lie & V. E. O'Leary (Eds.), *Storming the tower: Women in the academic world* (pp. 147-162). New York: Nichols/G. P. Publishing.

Sanderson, A., Phua, V. C., & Herda D. (2000). *The American faculty poll*, Chicago, National Opinion Research Center.

Sands, R. G., Parson L. A., & Duane, J. (1991). Faculty mentoring faculty in a public university. *The Journal of Higher Education, 62*(2), 174-193.

Schramm, S. L. (2000). *Thinking thrice: A feminist response to "mentoring" that marginalizes.* (ERIC Document Reproduction Service ED 446 443)

Sheehy, G. (1976). *Passages: Predictable crises of adult life*, New York: E. P. Dutton & Co., Inc.

Social change requires academic women's leadership. (2000, June). *Women in Higher Education, 9*(6), 1-2.

Sorcinelli, M. D. (1994). Effective approaches to new faculty development. *Journal of Counseling and Development, 72*(5), 474-479.

St. Clair, K. L. (1994). Faculty-to-faculty mentoring in the community college: An instructional component of faculty development. *Community College Review, 22*(3), 23-35.

Stalker, J. (1994). Athene in academe: Women mentoring women in the academy. *International Journal of Lifelong Education, 13*(5), 361-372.

Struthers, N. J. (1995). Differences in mentoring: A function of gender or organizational rank? *Journal of Social Behavior and Personality, 10*(6), 265-272.

A study on the status of women faculty in science at MIT. (1999). *MIT Faculty Newsletter, XI*(4), 1-12. Retrieved April 30, 2000 from the World Wide Web: http://web.mit.edu/fnl/women/women.html

Their jobs could be better, female profs report. (2000, May). *Women in Higher Education, 9*(5), 20.

Thompson, C. M. (1990). Mentoring among nurse-faculty. In L. B. Welsch (Ed.), *Women in higher education: Changes and challenges* (pp. 216-222). New York: Praeger.

University of Minnesota National Teleconference Program Committee. (1999, November). *Women's Voices, Women's Lives, Women's Solutions: Shaping a National Agenda for Women in Higher Education*, Paper produced for the Women's Voices, Women's Lives, Women's Solutions conference, Minneapolis, MN.

Vaillant, G. E. (1977). *Adaptation to life*, Boston, MA: Little, Brown and Company.

Watkins, R. M., Gillaspie, L. C., & Bullard, J. H. (1996, February). *The university community where equity can happen: Getting past the rhetoric.* Paper presented at the 48th annual meeting of the American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education, Chicago, IL. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service ED 393 827)

Wheeler, D. W., & Wheeler, B. J. (1994). Mentoring faculty for midcareer issues. *New Directions for Teaching and Learning, 57*, 91-100.

Whitt, E. J. (1991). Hit the ground running: Experiences of new faculty in a school of education. *The Review of Higher Education, 14*(2), 177-197.

Williams, B. (2001). *Adult learning theory: The mentoring connection*, (ERIC Document Reproduction Service ED 450 101)

Williams, R., & Blackburn, R. T. (1988). Mentoring and junior faculty productivity. *Journal of Nursing Education, 27*(5), 204-209.

Emotions in Women's Career Development: A Merging of Literatures

Rose Opengart
Laura Bierema
University of Georgia

Abstract: A critical review of the literatures of emotional intelligence, emotion work, and women's career development was conducted in order to examine relationships, similarities, and differences between emotions and women's learning and career development. Common themes are identified, future research questions are posed, and implications for women and organizations are drawn.

Keywords: Emotions, Women's Learning, Women's Career Development

Women's career development is affected by the cultural context of the workplace. The workplace has always been, and remains, a male-dominated and male-defined context. Masculine traits help women advance in the workplace. For women to be successful in their careers, they have been required to conform to this male model and emulate the male cultural standards (Bierema, 2000).

Career development theories, developed by and for men, do not effectively depict the nature of women's careers (Schreiber, 1998). The complex, non-linear pattern of women's careers places them in a situation where they have to try to conform in order to be successful within the work context. Developing themselves and their careers in a male-dominated environment requires working within power structures that reproduce the patriarchal status quo and force women to emulate male attributes and traits in order to advance in their careers.

One trait associated with men is that of being non-emotional. Gender differences exist in the expectations and acceptance of emotional expression. It is assumed in our society that women are more emotional than men and women managers have been accused of being "too emotional" (Crampton, 1999, p. 92). Because emotional intelligence and the ability to do emotion work have been cited as critical to success in the workplace (Callahan, 2000; Goleman, 1995; Cherniss, 2000), it is important to examine any relationship between emotions, gender, and career learning and development. There are no research studies that look at this combination of literatures to examine this issue.

Using a theoretical framework of emotional intelligence, emotion work, women's learning and career development literatures presents an opportunity to merge these areas and to understand the impact of emotional intelligence and skillful emotion work on women's career development. Additionally, approaching this research from a feminist perspective is appropriate because this research examines women within the workplace, a traditionally male-oriented context. In order to examine and understand women's behavior within this environment, one must examine prescriptions for feminine and masculine behaviors and consider their development within the context of our patriarchal, masculine society. The feminist perspective therefore allows the researcher to consider the dissonance between prescribed behaviors according to gender and those expected in the organizational context. The purpose of this paper is to review the literatures of emotional intelligence, emotion work, women's learning, and women's career development and examine any relationship between emotions and women's learning and career development.

Research Methodology

The authors conducted a literature review of empirical and research based articles to understand the theoretical and conceptual aspects of emotional intelligence, emotion work, women's learning, and women's career development. Definitions and current knowledge in each field were synthesized, compared and contrasted against each other. This inductive analysis allowed for any conceptual patterns, relationships, and themes between the literatures to be identified and then described. Limitations of this research include the lack of empirical data. This study is limited to literature review and would benefit from a future empirical study. Lastly, both authors are white women who have worked in the corporate context and therefore bring that particular perspective to this paper.

Emotion Literature

The two emotion literatures addressed in this paper include emotional intelligence and emotion work. Definitions of emotional intelligence vary somewhat between authors (see Table 1). Salovey and Mayer's (1990) model views

Copyright © 2002 Rose Opengart and Laura Bierema

emotional intelligence as a series of mental abilities including emotional perception, emotional integration or facilitation, emotional understanding, and emotional management. This model includes the capacity for identifying, inputting, and processing information. First comes the capacity to perceive and express feelings. Next, emotions alter cognition and facilitate thought. Emotions are then reasoned with and understood. Lastly, emotions are managed. The authors distinguish between their definition of emotional intelligence as an ability and others' definitions as including personality traits.

Goleman and Cherniss (1998) describe traits of emotional intelligence as having four dimensions: self-awareness, self-management, social awareness and social skills. Self-awareness involves knowing one's internal states, preferences, resources, and intuitions. Self-management involves managing one's internal states, impulses, and resources to facilitate reaching goals. Social awareness is defined as awareness of others' feelings, needs, and concerns. Social skills are defined as adeptness at inducing desirable responses in others (Cherniss, 2000). Bar-On (1997) characterizes emotional intelligence as "an array of noncognitive abilities, competencies, and skills that influence one's ability to succeed in coping with environmental demands and pressures" (p. 14).

Table 1. *Definitions of Emotional Intelligence - Three Main Branches*

Salovey and Mayer	Goleman/Cherniss	Bar-On
The emotional intelligence system is: The capacity to process information and reason with emotion ✓ To perceive emotion ✓ To integrate it into thought ✓ To understand ✓ To manage emotion	**Emotional intelligence includes:** ✓ Self-Awareness ✓ Self-Regulation ✓ Self-Motivation ✓ Social Awareness ✓ Social Skills	**Emotional intelligence is:** "an array of noncognitive abilities, competencies, and skills..." ✓ Intrapersonal EQ ✓ Interpersonal EQ ✓ Adaptability EQ ✓ Stress Management EQ ✓ General Mood EQ

Research has also focused on the relationship between emotional intelligence and leadership abilities. Evidence suggests that emotionally intelligent leadership results in improved business performance (Goleman, 2001). McClelland (1998) studied division heads of a global food and beverage company and found that the divisions of the leaders with strengths in emotional intelligence competencies outperformed yearly revenue targets by a margin of 15 to 20 percent. In a 1994 Catholic Health Association study of outstanding leaders in health care, it was found that more effective leaders were more adept at integrating key competencies (Goleman, 2001). Another study indicated that managers with self-awareness, an important aspect of emotional intelligence, are rated as more effective by both superiors and subordinates than those managers without self-awareness (Megerian & Sosik, 1999).

Definitions of emotion work also vary somewhat (see Table 2). Emotion work was defined in Hochschild's seminal work (1983) as the active attempt to change an emotion held by an individual and as the active effort to change or control emotions in oneself or in others in order to meet social guidelines. Morris and Feldman (1996) used the term emotional labor to describe the effort and control necessary for the expression of organizationally desired emotion. However, Hochschild described emotional labor as a term used only when emotion work is being performed as a required part of the job, in exchange for a wage.

Most of the early research on emotion work in the context of organizations is discussed only in terms of organizational control of employee emotion, either by the elimination of, the controlled display of (Domagalski, 1999; Fineman, 1993; Putnam & Mumby, 1993), or the self-management of emotions (Callahan, 2000). The emotion work research has examined how organizations have applied expectations and boundaries for employees' acceptable emotional expression. Methods used to accomplish this include screening and selection, training, off-the-job socialization opportunities, and reward and punishment (Domagalski, 1999). The expression of emotion, once a personal decision, has become a marketplace commodity, with standards and rules dictating how and when emotion should be expressed (Morris & Feldman, 1996). However, emotion work has also been studied as an employee-initiated move serving individuals' purposes and benefiting the employee to assist them in work endeavors and gain increased power and legitimacy (Fabian, 1999; Kipnis & Schmidt, 1983; Lerum, 2000; Rafaeli & Sutton, 1991).

Table 2. *Definitions of Emotion Work - Main Branches*

Hochschild	Fabian, Kipnis & Schmidt, Lerum, Rafaeli & Sutton
✓ Organizationally imposed control of emotion, including elimination of or controlled display of emotions ✓ Performed in exchange for pay ✓ Not viewed as beneficial by the employee	✓ May be employee initiated ✓ For the benefit of the employee ✓ Women perform more emotion work than men

Another aspect of the literature is the gendered nature of emotion work. Women are prepared for and placed in emotionally expressive positions (Parkin, 1996), such as human resources. Wharton (2000) concluded that women's jobs demand more emotion work than do men's while Callahan (2000) described how culture and gender biases cause the need for emotion work. The author found that women continually suppress emotions and evoke unfelt

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

emotions regarding their devalued gender role in order to fit in to the culture. Some researchers suggest that emotion requirements function to reproduce structural oppression (Brody, 2000; Parkin, 1996). Socializing men and women to express different emotions serves to maintain polarized gender roles and power and status differences (Brody, 2000). Emotions are controlled by those in power who define what is appropriate, imposing a pathology on emotional expressions that do not fit criteria (Parkin, 1996).

Many researchers have discussed the significance of emotional intelligence and emotion work in the workplace. Cherniss (2000) argued that emotional intelligence contributes to the bottom line in any organization. Goleman (1998) discussed the importance of emotional intelligence over that of traditional cognitive measures of intelligence. Salovey and Mayer (1990) demonstrated quick recovery from emotional situations. Similarly, Salovey, Mayer, Goldman, Turvey, and Palfai (1995) found emotional intelligence to be an indicator of those who can respond flexibly to change. Emotion work has been described as necessary for one's successful job performance (Callahan, 2000; Hochschild, 1979, 1983) as well as an effective tool of social influence (Kipnis et al., 1980; Rafaeli & Sutton, 1991).

The previous sections have defined emotional intelligence and emotion work, and detailed empirical studies of these phenomena. We will now turn to a discussion of women's career development.

Women's Career Development

Women's career development has been dominated by male-oriented theories that inadequately illuminate women's careers. For instance, trait-and-factor theories explain career choice as matching individual ability and interest with a work experience (Holland, 1966, 1985; Parsons, 1909). Trait-factor theories of career development are inappropriate for women because they perpetuate social role and sex stereotyping and assume that women have equal opportunity to explore matches between their personalities and work environments. Super's (1953) influential Life Span, Life Space Theory explains vocational development as a process of making several decisions culminating in career choices representing an implementation of the self-concept. Choices in this model are regarded as successively good matches between the vocational self and the world of work (Swanson and Fouad, 1999). Super recognized five career stages as growth, exploration, establishment, maintenance and disengagement. This model has been highly influential but falters when applied to women because it assumes linear, uninterrupted career trajectories, and ignores the fact that women's careers tend to be non-linear, characterized by interruption as women move in and out of the workforce.

Women began criticizing classical career development models during the 1960's. Today there are calls for career development theory accounting for the experiences of persons from poor families, persons of color and women (Farmer and Associates, 1997). Women's career patterns are complex because of social expectations for them to assume primary care giving and homemaking responsibility. Several forces are shaping women's distinctive career development including juggling multiple roles, the increasing availability of alternative work arrangements, and the eroding (however slight) of structural inequalities (Bierema, 1998; Schreiber, 1998). Women tend to develop occupational qualifications that are easily transferable between jobs to support their discontinuous careers (Edwards, Robinson, Welchman and Woodall, 1999). Although theorists agree that women's careers cannot be adequately explained by traditional theories of career development, there is disagreement about whether existing theories need modification or new ones need to be created (Swanson and Fouad, 1999).

A key learning issue for women at work is forging an identity in a male dominated world. The multiple roles women are expected to play can contradict and confuse identity. Masculine social roles in paid work are valued in the workplace while women's informal roles in relationships and caring for others are devalued (MacRae, 1995). Yet, relationships and caring are important aspects of women's self-identity. The meaning that women attach to their paid labor and the extent to which it is a salient and meaningful component of women's identity has been largely ignored (MacRae, 1995). The devaluation of women's roles in the paid workforce in effect suppresses women's identification with relationship and caring and may cause them to be untrue to themselves in exchange for a paycheck.

Table 3: *Women's Career Development*

✓	Influenced by gender role and social expectations
✓	Impacted by women's primary care-giving and homemaking responsibilities
✓	Impacted by increasing availability of alternative work arrangements
✓	Current models lack diversity
✓	Women do not generally follow career patterns similar to men
✓	Women must learn and follow "hidden curriculum" to succeed in male-dominated work contexts

Workplaces are social institutions, and thus, mirror the power structures and oppressive forces in society. Organizations are primarily male-dominated and success normally involves emulating the successful (Diekman and

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Eagly, 2000; Fagenson, 1990; Maniero, 1994). Hayes and Flannery (2000) suggest that like education, the workplace has hidden curricula that reproduce power structures. Evidence of this assertion is found in many studies suggesting that masculine traits help women advance at work. For instance, women at senior hierarchical levels in organizations scored significantly higher on measures of masculinity scales (Fagenson, 1990). Cejeka and Eagly (2000) explored the role of gender stereotyping in justifying social systems and gendered divisions of labor. They found that feminine personality or physical attributes were thought more essential for success in female-dominated occupations, while masculine personality or physical attributes were thought more essential in male dominated occupations. The masculine roles and personality attributes were also given higher prestige by study participants.

Diekman and Eagly (2000) conducted several studies to test the dynamism of stereotypes about men and women. They suggest that although women's presence in the workforce has created resistance to the corresponding change in women's roles and characteristics, there is a belief that women's personality, cognitive, and physical attributes will become more like those of men. In turn, these changes will provide greater access to top male-dominated roles and to socialization and training opportunities. In another study, Kolb (1999) found that the sex and personality trait of femininity had no significant effect on leader emergence, but self-confidence, attitude toward leadership, prior leadership experience, and the personality trait of masculinity did. Mainiero (1994) interviewed high-profile executive women and concluded that fast tracking was dependent upon assignment to a high visibility project, demonstration of high performance, attraction of top-level support, display of entrepreneurial initiative, and accurate identification with company values.

Career success is dictated by assuming masculine attributes, stereotyping gender roles, and following a set of "rules" for success. The result of these dynamics is the acculturation of women into male work culture, devaluation of women's gender roles, and deprivation of women's identity. Women's need or desire to buy into the "old boy" network may be explained by either suppression or unawareness of themselves as gendered beings (Bierema, 2000; Caffarella, Clark and Ingram, 1997). Women's uncritical career development not only causes them to adapt to a masculine model, but also prevents them from addressing power differentials or claiming a career on their own terms as women.

However, women in the workplace are in fact influenced by their gendered perspectives and experiences. For example, Egan (1996) considered the effect of epistemology on women's perceptions of the workplace, themselves and their work with relation to career mentoring. She applied the three epistemological categories of constructivists, proceduralists, and subjectivists as identified by Belenky, Clinchy, Goldberger and Tarule (1986). The author studied 41 women members of American Women in Radio and Television and concluded that mentoring needs depend on the type of knower the woman is.

'Constructivist knowers' provide the ideal model for mentoring success through meshing experience with objective reality, functioning with high levels of self-efficacy (viewing oneself as effective), and absorbing learning in all forms. Constructivists are likely to seek mentors in all guises, role models and consultants regardless of age, race, gender or appearance. On the other hand, 'procedural knowers' are less likely to seek mentors and to gain from being protégés. They recognize that men are favored in the workplace and view the women ahead of them as antagonists. Egan claims that the 'subjective knower' is unlikely to sacrifice relationship for career nor will she envision long term career goals if she has family obligations. She is unlikely to identify high career achieving women as role models and is lowest among the three knowers in self-efficacy. She will usually resist seeking career advice, but will listen to a sponsor or a challenge in recognition of her skills. Subjectivists, concludes Egan, are most likely to gain from formal mentoring programs. Egan's work, therefore, is a strong reminder that forging an identity in the workplace is not a "one size fits all" concern and that the woman's developmental level has an impact on her learning at work.

Common Themes

Several themes emerged during our comparative analysis of the literatures. These themes have significant implications for women's career development. The themes include learning and development patterns, career competencies, function of context, role expectations, the role of relationships, power issues, identity development, and issues of voice. Each will be discussed and implications for women, organizations, educators, and researchers will be delineated.

Learning and Development Patterns

The emotion literature tends to be highly linear and women's development literature tends to be non-linear. Emotional intelligence is described as having increasing levels of complexity that appear to follow a certain hierarchical trajectory. The first level in the developmental process is awareness of one's own emotions. This is thought to be a primary component of emotional intelligence, serving as a foundation for the other components

(Goleman, 1995; Lane, 2000; Salovey & Mayer, 1997). Lane and Schwartz (1987) proposed that emotional awareness, an individual's ability to recognize and describe emotion in oneself and others, is a cognitive skill that develops in a process much like that described by Piaget's stages of cognitive development. In order to progress to the next stage in development, one needs to first be accurately attuned to the self in order to differentiate one's own emotions from those of others (Lane, 2000). Much of the writing on emotional intelligence parallels cognitive development literature.

This linear development process is similar to some of the traditional adult development theories proposed by Perry, Erickson and Lovenger. However, such adult development theories have been criticized for basing their conclusions on empirical studies using only white men. More recent studies of women's development point to a less linear developmental process.

Traditional career development theories also suggest that people have linear, uninterrupted career paths. The theories assume a career progression that continuously builds upon previous experiences. A major shortcoming of these theories, however, is that they were developed by and for men, and they fail to address the complexity and variation that women experience in their career experience. Newer, non-linear women's career theories are emerging (Bierema; Schrieber, 1998) that account for social expectations of women as the primary caregivers and nurturers. These new theories also consider important variables such as age, race, social class, and sexual orientation (Bierema, 1998; Farmer & Associates, 1997; Mott, 1998; Johnson-Bailey & Tisdell, 1998), entrepreneurship (Inman, 1998), and training and development opportunities (Knoke & Isho, 1999; McDonald & Hite, 1998).

The implications for women include seeking career guidance that avoids automatically placing them into career paths or rewarding them for stereotypical female behaviors. Organizations can help by providing this type of career guidance and assistance. Educators need to teach alternative developmental models that apply to women as well as men. Researchers can explore alternative models and study intersection between emotional learning and career development.

Role Expectations

Social and contextual expectations are powerful teachers of appropriate roles and emotions. An issue concerning women in the emotions literature is the extent to which the emotional responses they learn and express in the workplace serve to reinforce patriarchal systems that ultimately oppress women. Success in many organizations requires women to emulate men, fulfill male role expectations, and suppress femininity and caring roles. Conversely, there has been a trend toward valuing the unique roles that women bring into the workplace by virtue of their gender.

Calas and Smircich (1993) explore this phenomena and ask "What is the historical significance of recent discussions about 'women's ways of leading' and the 'female advantage'?" (p. 1). They have termed such constructs as "feminine-in-management"—the process of women bringing "female" emotions and style to the workplace to foster performance and change—and argue that they do little beyond reinforcing existing gendered power relations in organizations. They suggest that valuing essential women's qualities creates an illusion of opportunity and equality in the managerial world while blocking critical reflection on the underlying assumptions of the structure of patriarchy. Recently the *New York Times* (2001) published an article on "Bully Broads." Bully Broads is a training program for women who have become too "masculine" and hard driving in their roles (according to their male managers). They attend training to soften their rough edges and become more feminine in their management style.

Similarly, in the emotions literature, evidence exists for an interaction between a leader's gender, expressed emotion, and perception of effectiveness (Lewis, 2000). Leader effectiveness ratings decreased dramatically when women expressed anger, but remained unchanged when male leaders expressed anger. On the contrary, sadness expressed by women resulted in increased perceptions of leader effectiveness, yet expression of sadness by male leaders led to decreased ratings (Lewis, 2000).

Implications exist to increase the consciousness of role expectations. Women need to be critical toward expected roles and learning and training opportunities. Organizations need to be aware of creating and reinforcing role expectations and of sending conflicting gender role messages to their employees. Educators can help increase consciousness of gendered power relations and researchers can study role development and women's efforts to find voice in the workplace.

The Role of Context

One of the similarities between the literatures of emotion and women's development is the importance of context. Context has a significant impact on the development of women's careers, as well as in the development and effective use of emotions. Emotions can only be understood within a particular social context. They are socially learned and interpreted and culturally specific. Many explain emotions not merely as biological forces, but as

learned behaviors from both early and work-related organizational socialization (Domalgalski, 1999). Comparatively, learning is situational and dependent on the environment that provides tools and cues to guide learning.

Career development depends on the work context to yield behavioral clues. A challenge of working in a male dominated organization, however, is that the context functions to reinforce women's conformity to the patriarchal standards characterizing organizational culture. In both instances therefore, development of emotional intelligence and emotion work abilities as well as career development, women's learning and development are framed by the situation and context that can have either positive or negative consequences for women employees.

The importance of context creates many implications. Women need to understand how their context affects them. Organizations, educators, and researchers need to examine and understand how organizations and the patriarchal structure reinforce gender stereotypical behavior, including specific emotional responses.

Relationships and Connection

The importance of connection in women's learning and career development is repeated throughout the literature (Belenky et al, 1987; Caffarella & Olson, 1993; Gilligan, 1979). Belenky et al. (1987) concluded that connected learning is most effective when members of a group meet over long periods of time and know each other well. They define it as learning that is grounded in relationship, reciprocity and conversation. It is also a means of identifying common ground among learners. Further, it has been found that developing a sense of connection is an important feature in the development of gender consciousness among women (Bierema, 2000).

MacRae (1995) found, in a study of elderly women, that the women tend to describe themselves in terms of their interpersonal relationships. Gilligan (1979) also argues that relationships and connectedness with others are of central importance to women's development and writes, "the female comes to know herself as she is known through her relationships with others" (p.437). Giesbrecht (1998) found through factor analysis that in the construction and negotiation of identity, "male perspectives emphasized instrumentality and female perspectives emphasized social connection" (p.7). Ruddick (1996) notes that the idea of a relational self or that humans are composed by the relationships in which they participate, helps explain how women become connected knowers. Finally, Caffarella & Olson (1993) note in their critical review of the literature on the psychosocial development of women that: "What surfaced as central to the developmental growth of women was the web of relationships and connectedness to others" (p.135).

Relationship and connection are clearly pivotal to women's development, yet often women and men are expected to suppress emotions in the workplace and display emotions that are the opposite of how they feel. The emotion literature also discusses awareness of others' feelings and the ability to be inspirational and motivational as aspects of emotional intelligence. These abilities imply a connection towards other people. The contradiction it seems is not with developmental processes or emotions, but the contexts in which both are actualized.

Women need to use their own initiative to seek out mentors and networks and organizations can assist and support these relationships. Educators need to teach of the importance of developing mentoring relationships as well as particular skills involved in accomplishing this. Researchers can examine different forms of developmental relationships in the workplace to help determine which are the most effective.

Identity Development

Many fields have broadly conceptualized the self in terms of multiple identities, with individuals holding perceptions of themselves in terms of traits and values, attributes, experiences, thoughts and action, physical appearance, demographic attributes, and dispositions of various sorts (Leonard, Beavers, & Scholl, 1999). Gender is socially constructed and a part of human identity development that is based on life experience. Self-identity has been found to be created through participating in work, private life, community and other social entities. Gender socialization may result in both identity development and identity conflict. For instance, women and men may be socialized to fulfill sex role expectations that conflict with their self-image, goals, or occupation. MacRae (1995) suggests that women's identity has been conceptualized in terms of formal roles in the paid work arena dominated by male experience while their informal roles, such as relationships and care giving, have been ignored and made invisible. When women try to challenge formal or informal roles, resistance is high and leveled from friends, families and co-workers. This results in high levels of emotion work to fit into the work culture.

Implications exist for assisting women to develop an identity with which they feel comfortable. Organizations need to avoid framing women into particular roles, allowing women to effectively and authentically develop themselves. Educators can teach the importance of developing identity and the fact that gender is socially constructed. Researchers can assist the effort by studying identity development and its interaction with gender construction.

Devaluing of Women

Theories of women's development and career development underscore the fact that women have been devalued in theory and in social context. Their experiences have been ignored, minimalized, or lumped in with those of men. Emotion work functions to devalue women by the organizational expectation that women will emote in ways that serve the business. Career success rests on getting their emotions "right." Often this involves suppressing or denying identity as women altogether. Such suppression helps women succeed individually, but it only reinforces oppressive patriarchal culture that prevents women from accruing power and influence.

Organizations, educators, and researchers alike need to make women and women's identity visible. At the same time they must accept gender differences, it is also crucial to avoid framing and reproducing gender role stereotypes. Women need to first become aware of this gender devaluing and increase their gender consciousness in order to challenge oppression.

Future Research

The purpose of this literature review was to examine the literatures of emotional intelligence, emotion work, women's learning and women's career development in order to examine similarities and differences between the literatures, as well as derive some implications for human resource development and women's career development. We have several recommendations and questions for pursuing future research:

- ✓ How does emotional intelligence develop for women in the workplace?
- ✓ What types of emotional learning experiences benefit women's development and career development?
- ✓ Do patterns of women's emotional development differ from men's?
- ✓ Do patterns of women's emotional development differ based on race, social class, sexual orientation, etc?
- ✓ To what extent does emotion work reinforce patriarchy?

References

Bar-On, R. (1997). *Bar-On Emotional Quotient Inventory (EQ-i): A test of emotional intelligence.* Toronto, Canada: Multi-Health Systems.

Belenky, M. F., Clinchy, B. M., Goldberger, N. R., & Taruk, J. M. (1986). *Women's ways of knowing: The development of self, voice, and mind.* New York: Basic Books.

Bierema, L. L. (1998). *Women's career development across the lifespan: Insights, and strategies for women, organizations and adult educators.* New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education, No. 80. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Bierema, L. L. and Cseh, M. (2000). "Evaluating HRD Research Using a Feminist Research Framework." Paper presented at the Academy of Human Resource Development Conference, Raleigh Durham.

Bowler, M. (1999). Women's earnings: An overview. *Monthly Labor Review.* December, 13-21.

Brody, L. R. (2000). The socialization of gender differences in emotional expression: Display rules, infant temperament, and differentiation. In A. Fischer (Ed.), *Gender & Emotion: Social Psychological Perspectives.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Caffarella, R. S., Olson, S.K. (1993). "Psychosocial development of women: A critical review of the literature." Adult Education Quarterly 43(3): 125-151.

Caffarella, Rosemary; Clark, Carolyn and Ingram, Peggy. "Life at the Glass Ceiling: Women in Mid-Level Management Positions" in the 27th Annual SCUTREAConference Proceedings, 1997.

Callahan, J. (2000). Women in a "combat, masculine-warrior" culture: The performance of emotion work. *The Journal of Behavioral and Applied Management, 1*(1), 104.

Catalyst. *Women of color in corporate management: A statistical Picture.* New York: Catalyst, 1997.

Cejeka, M. A., and Eagly, A. H. (2000). Gender-stereotypic images of occupations correspond to the sex segregation of employment. *Personality and social psychology bulletin, 25*(4), 413-423.

Cherniss, C. (Ed.). (2000). *Social and emotional competence in the workplace.* San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

Diekman, A. B., and Eagly, A. H. (2000). Stereotypes as dynamic constructs: Women and me of the past, present and future. *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin, 26* (10), 1171-1188.

Domagalski, T. A. (1999). Emotion in organizations: Main currents. *Human Relations, 52*(6), 833-853.

Edwards, C., Robinson, R., Welchman, R. and Woodall, J. Lost opportunities? Organizational restructuring and women managers. *Human Resource Management Journal,* 1999, 9(1), 55-64.

Egan, K. S. (1996). Flexible mentoring: Adaptations in style for wo men's ways of knowing. *The Journal of Business Communication,, 33*(4), 401.

Fineman, S. E. (1993). *Emotion in organizations.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, Inc.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Fagenson, E. A. (1990). Perceived masculine and feminine attributes examined as a function of individuals' sex and level in the organizational power hierarchy: A test of four theoretical perspectives. *Journal of Applied Psychology, 75,* 204-211.

Farmer, H. S. and Associates. (1997). *Diversity and women's career development: From adolescence to adulthood.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Fineman, S. E. (1993). *Emotion in organizations.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, Inc.

Giesbrecht, N. (1998). Gender patterns of psychosocial development. *Sex Roles, 39*(5/6), 463-478.

Goleman, D. (1995). *Emotional intelligence:* New York, NY: Bantam Books.

Goleman, D. and Cherniss, G. (1998). *Bringing emotional intelligence to the workplace.* Report: The Consortium for Research on Emotional Intelligence in Organizations.

Hayes, E. and Flannery, D. D. (2000). *Women as learners: The significance of gender in adult learning.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Holland, J. (1966). A psychological classification scheme for vocations and major fields. *Journal of Counseling Psychology, 13,* 278-288.

Holland, J. (1985). *Making vocational choices: A theory of vocational personalities and work environments.* New York: Prentice Hall.

Hochschild, A. R. (1983). *The managed heart: Commercialization of human feeling.* Los Angeles, CA: University of California Press

Kipnis, D., Schmidt, S. M., & Wilkinson, I. (1980). Intraorganizational influence tactics: Explorations in getting one's way. *Journal of Applied Psychology, 65,* 440-452.

Knoke, D. & Ishio, Y. (1998). The gender gap in company training. *Work and Occupations, 25* (2), 141-167.

Kolb, J. (1999). The effect of gender role, attitude toward leadership, and self-confidence on leader emergence: Implications for leadership development. *Human Resource Development Quarterly, 10*(4), 305-320.

Lerum, K. (2000). *Doing the dirty work: Emotion work, professionalism, and sexuality in a customer service ecomony,* Unpublished dissertation, University of Washington

MacRae, H. M. (1995). Women and caring: Constructing the self through others. *Journal of Women and Aging,* 7(1-2), 145-158.

Mainiero, L. A. (1994). Getting anointed for advancement: The case of executive women. *Academy of Management Executive, 8,* (2), 53-67.

McClelland, D. C. (1998). Identifying competencies with behavioral-event interviews. *Psychological Science, 9*(5), 331-339.

McDonald, K. S. and Hite, L. M. (1998). Human resource development's role in women's career progress. In L. Bierema (Ed.) *Women's career development across the lifespan: Insights, and strategies for women, organizations and adult educators.* New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education, no. 80. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Megerian, L. E., & Sosik, J. J. (1996). An affair of the heart: Emotional intelligence and transformational leadership. *The Journal of Leadership Studies, 3*(3), 31-48.

Morris, J. A., & Feldman, D. C. (1996). The dimensions, antecedents, and consequences of emotional labor. *Academy of Management Review, 21*(4), 986-1010.

Parkin, W. (1996). The public and the private: Gender, sexuality, and emotion. In S. Fineman (Ed.), *Emotion in Organizations* (pp. 167-189). London: Sage Publications.

Parsons, F. (1909). *Choosing a vocation*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin.

Putnam, L. L., & Mumby, D. (Eds.). (1993). *Organizations, emotion, and the myth of rationality.* London: Sage Publications.

Rafaeli, A., & Sutton, R. I. (1991). Emotional contrast strategies as a means of social influence: Lessons from criminal interrogators and bill collectors. *Academy of Management Journal, 34*(4), 749-775.

Salovey, P., & Mayer, J. D. (1990). Emotional intelligence. *Imagination, Cognition, and Personality, 9,* 185-211.

Salovey, P., & Mayer, J. D. (1993). The Intelligence of emotional intelligence. *Intelligence, 17,* 433-442.

Schrieber, P. J. (1998). "Women's career development patterns." In L. L. Bierema (Ed.), *Women's career development across the lifespan: Insights, and strategies for women, organizations and adult educators.* New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education, No. 80.

Super, D. (1953). A theory of vocational development. *American Psychologist, 8,* 185-190.

Swanson, J. L. and Fouad, N. A. (1999). *Career theory and practice: Learning through case studies.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Wharton, A. (2000). Feminism at work. *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science, 571,* 167-183.

The Meaning of Korean Women's Experience of Reentering the Workforce

Yu-Jin Lee
Gary N. McLean
University of Minnesota

A qualitative study of the experiences of reentry women in Korea was conducted using phenomenology. The research question was, What is the meaning of the experience of women reentering the workplace after a career interruption caused by marriage or childbearing? Individual telephone interviews were conducted with each of six women who had reentered the workplace after a career interruption caused by a change in the women's family roles. The interviews yielded much rich, detailed, and revealing data.

Key words: Women's Reentry, Career Interruption, Korea

A global trend appears to be an increasing number of working women, at least in industrialized countries. The USA, Europe, and Asia have witnessed more women working outside the home over the past decades (Santrock, 1994; Hakim, 1996; Kim, 1999). As women enter the workforce, societies, at levels from families to nations, have kept altering and adapting their explicit and implicit rules and policies to accommodate working women's needs.

In the last 30 years, Korean women's economic participation rate has been increasing gradually, and women are becoming essential in Korea's labor force. In addition, the number of women completing higher education has increased (Moon, 1998), adding more professional work and a greater variety of types of work into women's labor options. In the past, these options had consisted of unskilled and low paying jobs. Despite this change, Korea's female workforce development has a long way to go, even compared to other Asian countries such as Japan, Hong Kong, or Singapore. Korean women, especially, even those with higher education, have a high tendency of career interruptions due to marriage or childbearing and childrearing (Kim, 1999). This pattern inhibits continuous workforce development, impeding women's potential.

After the economic crisis that hit Korea in 1997, many became unemployed from their previously trustworthy lifetime workplace. Now, the concept of a lifetime workplace is gradually disappearing. With this unstable economic trend, a two-income family has become desirable. More women want to continue working without career interruptions, and an increasing number of women want to reenter the workforce after a career interruption.

Unlike the situation in some other countries, it is not easy to return to school in Korea because of the rigid higher education system. When reentry women want to change their career field, it is not easy for them to obtain a good education or training in higher education. Thus, most of them turn to short-term vocational schools or social and cultural education centers where skills and knowledge are usually geared toward low-paying, low-level jobs. As a result, many reentry women settle for low paying jobs that do not require a high level of knowledge or skills.

As a researcher and a Korean single woman, Lee's interest in reentry women came from friends who had quit their jobs after marriage or child bearing. Most said that they hoped to go back to work, but their plans were vague. Some of them tried to reenter the workplace several times, but they have not yet succeeded. The sandwich generation grew up believing that a normal and ideal family has a father as the sole breadwinner and a mother who is the full-time homemaker. However, with the recent unstable Korean economy in the last couples of years, the concept of dual-career women has become idealized and desirable. Starting from these personal interests, Lee wanted to understand those women who have already experienced or who are currently experiencing reentry in Korea. The purpose of this study was to uncover the meaning of the reentry experience of women in Korea.

Literature Review

Reentry women has generally described women reentering educational institutions or the labor force after an absence for an extended period of time, ranging from a few years to over 30 years (Padula, 1994). In this study, it refers to women who have reentered the workforce after a career interruption due to their family responsibilities, such as childbearing or childrearing. Most of the studies done with reentry women have focused on adult women students (Petersen, 1991). Thus, there is a lack of research concerning women's reentering the workplace in Korea.

There is no comprehensive theory of women's career development (Betz, 1987). However, it is well documented that career developmental models based on male experiences cannot be applied to women's career

Copyright © 2002 Yu-Jin Lee and Gary N. McLean

development (Eastmond, 1991). This discrepancy based on gender can be partly explained by the fact that women tend to have more interruptions in their career paths than men, whose career paths tend to be more linear.

Research regarding reentry women was conducted mostly in the 1980's and early 1990's in the USA, but these studies have focused mostly on reentry women in educational settings (Padula, 1994). It is not known whether this group of reentry women differs from those reentering the workplace with respect to their roles, values, concerns about family, personalities, general characteristics, motivation, and the like.

According to Even (1987), career interruption partially explains the wage gap between male and female workers. If female workers do not return to work after the typical maternity leave, the likelihood of an early return to work quickly becomes remote.

Watkins (1988) illustrated what reentry women would face when they contemplate returning to work:

> Women who return to work after several years find that the men and women they used to work with have received regular pay increases, promotions, and on-the-job training that have made them more valuable to their organizations, at the same time that the reentry woman's skills have grown rusty and outmoded (p. 52). They must compete with younger men and women for jobs they would long since have outgrown had they stayed at work. Their social status while at home has often been a function of volunteer work and of their husband's status (generally higher than that associated with the jobs for which women must now apply), and they may feel threatened by having to consider jobs their children would find demeaning. (p. 54)

Research Question and Methodology

The research question was, What is it like for Korean women to reenter the workplace after a career interruption caused by marriage or childbearing? Because individual reentry women have different backgrounds and contexts, we believe that it is important to understand the core essence of the experience of reentry into the work force after a career interruption.

A qualitative investigation using phenomenology was undertaken. Qualitative research is used when the underlying theories are not formulated, the existing theories are questioned, or when the phenomenon has received minimal empirical examination and requires an exploratory descriptive approach (Denzin & Lincoln, 1994). Among several qualitative approaches, phenomenological research emphasizes the meaning of lived experience; it examines how human beings construct and give meaning to concrete social situations (Creswell, 1998). The focal point of phenomenological research is to "borrow" other people's experiences and their reflections on their experience for better understanding of the deeper meaning or context of the whole human experience (van Manen, 1990).

Methods

Participants and Researchers as Persons

Six Korean reentry women participated in this study. The reasonable number of participants (or subjects) in a phenomenological study varies from 3 to 10 (Creswell, 1997; Dukes, 1984; Polkinghorne, 1989). The researchers considered six participants to be enough to describe the meaning of the phenomena in this study. The snowball sampling method (Patton, 1990) was used to locate participants with the help of friends. Two Korean women development centers helped locate two participants. Two criteria were used in choosing the interview participants: the participant must have had the experience of reentry into the workplace after at least one year of career interruption caused by the demands of the women's domestic roles, and the participant must be willing to participate in the research and share their reentry experiences. Table. 1 shows a brief description of each participant. Participants signed consent forms that stated the purpose of the research, the process of the interview, the possible advantages and disadvantages of participating in the study, and their freedom to quit at any time during the interviews.

Lee was 29 years old at the time of the research, a single female Korean Ph. D. student studying Human Resource Development at the University of Minnesota. She graduated from a women's college in Seoul, Korea, and has been in the USA for 6 years to study. McLean has a longstanding interest in the issue of gender equity (see, for example, McLean & Crawford, 1979). Further, McLean has a longstanding interest in Korea, having four adopted Korean children, having several former and current Korean advisees, conducting research and consultancies in Korea for more than a decade, and editing *Korean Philately*, the official journal of the Korea Stamp Society..

Table 1. *Participant Demographics*

Participant	Age	Years of Marriage	# of Children	Education	Job before Career Interruption	Job after Career Interruption
B	28	2	none	College	Teaching assistant	Counselor
C	30	3	1	College	Secretary	Secretary
J	30	5. 5	2	College	Secretary	Secretary
Y	29	5	2	2-year college	Telemarketing	Credit card customer service
L	32	6	2	High school	Sales person	Insurance agent
P	30	5	1	2-year college	Graphic design instructor	Web design instructor

Data Collection

The interview questions were semi-structured in order to stimulate the participants' responses about their reentry experiences:

- Describe your experience of reentry into the workplace after a career interruption caused by marriage or childrearing?
- Describe your first week after reentry into the workplace?
- Do you think about work differently after reentry?
- What did the experience of reentry mean to you?

These questions were used as guiding questions, and the interviews were led openly and freely as the participants revealed their experiences; other questions were asked for a fuller description of their experiences.

Since the senior author is studying in the U.S. and the participants were in Korea, the interviews were conducted via telephone. Participants were asked to find a place where there would be few interruptions and where they could express themselves freely. The interviews lasted about 60-90 minutes and were tape-recorded and transcribed verbatim in Korean.

Data Analysis

Giorgi (1975) developed procedures for data analysis in phenomenological research. The procedures help researchers bracket their preconceptions and rigorously focus on the phenomenon for the other. By dwelling on and reflecting upon the exact words of each person, the researcher can uncover the salient features of the phenomenon (Polkinghorne, 1989).

The procedural steps used, as outlined by Giorgi (1985), were:

1. Gaining a sense of the whole.
2. Identifying meaning units.
3. Labeling and defining themes.
4. Transforming the participants' language into a more abstract language.
5. Synthesizing the transformed meaning units from all participants' protocols into a final general description of the phenomenon being studied.

Since the raw data were in Korean, the text was not translated until the fifth step of the data analysis. Then, the results of the data analysis were translated into English.

Sense of the Whole. The first step of the analysis involved gaining an overall sense of the major ideas that were provided by the participants by reading the whole interview text over and over again. The following is a part of one interview text provided in order to give the readers a holistic sense.

The reason I made up my mind to go back to work was a thought that came to me very slowly, but firmly, that a woman also needs economic power. It was strong. That point came...right after I quit my former job....You know that you spend much more money when you get married. I had to save. I also had a plan to buy a house. Those issues struck me so strongly after I quit my job. Strange, huh? But time passed so quickly while raising my daughter. When I thought about returning to the workplace, people around me said it's very hard for a married woman to get a job, but a single woman could change her job very easily. Those rumors made me nervous. My insides were stirring and I felt sick. The moment when I was informed that I got a job again...I felt like I had conquered the whole world.

Identifying Meaning Units. After gaining a sense of the whole by reading and dwelling on the interviews, the

senior author identified blocks of meaning units in each participant's interview. Meaning units are "constituents of the experience, not elements, in that they retain their identity as contextual parts of the subject's specific experience" (Polkinghorne, 1989, p. 54). Each meaning unit was written in the participants' own language.

Labeling and Defining Themes. The senior author labeled each meaning unit with a simple and concise statement of the dominant natural meaning of the unit and wrote a sentence in the senior author's words that defined the theme. Each participant's interview text was printed on papers of different colors and then was cut into meaning units. A theme was then marked on each meaning unit. After eliminating meaning units unrelated to the research question, meaning units were clustered into similar themes.

Transforming the Meaning Units into More Abstract Language. The research question was applied to each meaning unit and its accompanying theme to draw out aspects related to the research question. These were re-described in language from the perspective of women's career development. Reflection and imaginative variation were used in this process.

Synthesizing: Universal Wisdom. The last step of phenomenology requires moving from the parts (individual interviews) to the whole (all interviews). Synthesis involves tying together and integrating the list of transformed meaning units into a consistent and systematic general description of the essential structure of the experience under investigation (Polkinghorne, 1989). In this procedure, the re-described meaning units were read through and then a general description of the structure underlying the variations in the meanings were described.

Results

Seven themes emerged from the data analysis: 1) giving up the fantasy of becoming a happy homemaker; 2) feeling not welcomed; 3) first come, first served; 4) feeling empowered; 5) feeling guilty; 6) being vulnerable to the patriarchal workplace culture; and 7) redefining one's meaning of work. Two universal wisdoms were perceived from the participants' experiences: experiential life learning and the desire to be self-sufficient. Each theme follows; participant initials are used for attribution. The following meaning units in each theme are inclusive but not exclusive. Only three to four meaning units in each theme are presented here due to the limited space.

Giving up the Fantasy of Being a Happy Homemaker.

Five of the participants were surprised to find that they did not enjoy being a full-time homemaker:

I was bored to death after staying at home for two months, and I was very tired of just cooking and cleaning all day. One day I really had a deep thought about why people should have three meals a day (J).

I quit my job after the wedding. I believed that becoming a homemaker would be the key to my happiness. You know... baking cookies... From my childhood, I've always held a grudge against my working mom, and I wanted so much to stay home after marriage. I didn't want to give that emptiness to my child. But, to my surprise, I felt emptiness at home. I felt like my feet were not grounded on the earth. Even when I was with my son, I felt confined, lonely, and alone. I found myself envying my working mom. I realized that being a stay-at-home mom was a harder job for me (C).

I was hungry for conversation all day. I was a graphic design instructor before. You can imagine how hungry for adult interaction I was. I was practically deaf for three years. Negative thinking haunted me, and it led me to "housewife's depression." If I had felt happy staying home, I wouldn't have gotten a job again (P).

I just don't do housekeeping well. I enjoy a clean and organized home only when other people do that for me. So, I thought I could do this level of housekeeping even if I worked outside. I thought I was better at working (Y).

Feeling Unwelcomed.

Participants found to their dismay that, when they returned to work, the workplace did not welcome them:

I was 29 then, and I didn't think that I was that old to get a job. Because I didn't have a child and didn't live with my parents-in-law, I thought that nothing could block my getting a job. But every interviewer asked me if I was married and rejected me (B).

First, I contacted a graphic design institute for a job as an instructor, but they told me they didn't hire married women. They seemed to worry that my married life would interfere with my teaching (P).

I began searching for a job that would fit me. I preferred a job with a regular income and fixed office hours, such as an office job. But I couldn't find such a job for a married woman. So I chose a sales job (L).

First Come, First Served.

The participants found that they accepted the first job that was offered, rather than taking more time to find something that might be more appropriate.

I accepted a job offer as a temporary secretary, filling in for other women on maternity leave. I knew that it was not a good option, but I couldn't help it. I didn't have any power in this situation. I had to swallow my pride to get a job. If I had insisted on a full-time permanent position, there wouldn't have been any job for me. And that means that I would be getting further away from the job market as time passed (J).

While I was doing a part-time job, one of my friends introduced me to an insurance agency. At first, I thought I'd just give it a try to become an insurance salesperson, just for three months to see if I liked it. I didn't think about it seriously (L).

I searched for a job for a while and couldn't find any good one. One day my sister hooked me up to a telemarketing job, and I took the job without hesitation. One year later, I quit that telemarketing job because it wasn't my type of work (Y).

Feeling Empowered.

The outcome of the work experience was to give the participants a sense of empowerment, both at work and at home.

People recognize that I became brighter and more cheerful. In the past, some told me that, even when I smiled, they could see the sadness in my eyes. Now any word coming out of my mouth is positive. I became positive. My body was full of irritability before, but these days, I take care of my children differently—better and more patiently. Even though I feel tired after work, I help my children with their homework at least 30 minutes a day, which I didn't do before. I became much more confident in myself. To be honest, I still have some fear, but I think I will be able to be a leader for my family and raise my children in case my husband gets laid off (L).

When I stayed at home, I didn't put on makeup. I didn't take care of myself. Now I take good care of myself—my appearance, my attitude, and my behavior. I feel good about myself. And my husband likes it, too (Y)!

When I didn't make money, I hesitated to spend money on myself. I didn't feel right about buying myself clothes, buying my friend lunch, or paying for my lessons, such as English tutoring. People would laugh if I got English tutoring. English tutoring...what for? Now I can do those things without feeling sorry for my husband. Even when I have to help my parents with money, I feel so free that I don't have to get permission from my husband. It feels good (J).

I feel as though I were an iron woman. I work, take care of the children, support my husband, and do my best as a good daughter-in-law for my parents-in-law (L).

Feeling Guilty.

In spite of the sense of empowerment that most participants felt, there was also a sense of guilt about what their decision means to those around them.

My mother is babysitting my daughter while I am at work. I feel so sorry and thankful that she does this for me. She comes to my home every day from afar. My mother spent her whole life raising her children, and now again for her granddaughter. When my daughter was in daycare, she looked sad and weak. She needed special care and attention as there were more than 17 kids per teacher. She got so sick one day that I had to quit my job temporarily to take care of her. I felt very guilty about her sickness. I didn't tell my husband's family that I went back to work. They would disapprove of my working (P).

My husband lost 10 pounds after I began working because I could not cook as often as I did before. When my parents-in-law noticed his weight loss, I felt ashamed and guilty (B).

The first day I said goodbye to my son at the door to go to work, I cried so hard. I felt so sorry for him even though he is too young to know that I am off to work. For a couple of months, I didn't even put any picture of my son in the office. It hurt very much (C).

It troubles me every day more than 12 times a day, especially when I have to go out to work early in the morning before my children get up, and I can see them only two hours at night, I feel bad (Y).

Being Vulnerable to the Patriarchal Workplace Culture.

The participants recognized that the rigid workplace culture does not accommodate their personal needs.

My department consists of mostly women. They are all single, except for me. They go home after 9 pm because there is always overtime work. I try to get out one or two hours earlier, but I feel odd. I sometimes feel isolated because I am the only married woman there. It seems that I am the only one complaining. In the beginning, the employer told me that closing time would be 5:30 pm. If I had known then what I do now, I wouldn't have chosen this job (Y).

I love my workplace. It's my second home. It has a daycare so that I can bring my kid whenever she wants to go with me. Nobody frowns on bringing your child to work. They treat the kids like their own nieces and nephews. I guess it's because my workplace is a women's development center. I have been in an ordinary workplace before where I had to please my employer and couldn't request any special favors for my personal needs. They didn't want to accommodate employees' creative thinking and demanded that I adjust to their way of socializing—drinking. I'll never go back to that ordinary workplace again (P).

I don't think my workplace can afford my maternity leave. It's a tacit agreement. Actually, I took over my job when the former employee left to have a baby. Nobody told me to leave, but I just know how it works here. I wish I could find a more stable workplace next time (B).

Redefining the Meaning of Work

The participants recognize that what they work for is not the same as it was before they left their original workplace.

If I could continue working without a break, I would consider working to be so boring and would take it for granted, wondering what I was working for. I would be dreaming about something other than working. Making money is definitely important, but socializing with people at work is also a joy. Meeting people and doing things together... I didn't know that it would mean so much to me. You don't appreciate what you already have. Then once you lose it, you realize how valuable it was (C).

In the past, it was an obligation that led me to work. I had to support my family with my salary. Even when I didn't feel like working, I had to do it because my family's financial situation was not good. But now I am really enjoying my job, free from the stress of having to make money. I would do my job, even without getting paid (P).

In the past I worked just because I wanted to set a role model as a professional secretary. I wanted to show people that the job of secretary could also be performed professionally. However, that doesn't matter to me anymore; now I work to save more money while I am still young. Nowadays, it's very hard to save money and set a financial foundation if the husband alone works (J).

Discussion

The seven themes are presented in the order of the women's experiences. The first theme, giving up the fantasy of being a full-time homemaker, emerged when the reentry women in this study were at home during their career breaks. All of the participants in this study considered marriage and childbearing to be significant changes in their lives to the extent that they had to change their lifestyles dramatically—quitting work and staying home. They fantasized about being a wife and full-time mother and idealized staying at home. Furthermore, they did not doubt that they would regret that decision to stay home later. They soon realized that being a full time homemaker was not as satisfactory, rewarding, and interesting for them as they imagined.

The second theme, feeling unwelcomed, is derived from the experience of finding that getting hired was much narrower and harder for married, reentry women than for younger, single women. The participants became frustrated and discouraged when they saw "female singles only" job advertisements or when they were rejected at job interviews due to their marital status. The participants suddenly felt that they had become "old and second hand" in the labor market. On the other hand, interestingly enough, they understand the perception of reentry women as rusty and outdated in the labor market in Korea.

The next theme, first come, first served, concerns the moment they chose their jobs upon reentry. After facing the narrow and harsh labor market reality for reentry women, they chose whatever came first. Some women regretted their decision later if they had not obtained enough information about the job, including its downsides and its dead-end reality. Some women are satisfied with their decision if it leads to career progress.

The fourth theme involves feeling empowered. All of the participants felt empowered after they reentered the

workplace–financially, physically, emotionally, and mentally. This feeling is a positive reinforcement for reentering the workplace. The participants compared this feeling with how powerless they had felt when they stayed at home. One participant said, "It feels like I conquered the world." Two participants in this study stated that they learned how to love and take care of themselves. Some mentioned that they did not want to be superwomen, but they just felt more energized to do the housework more joyfully and effectively than before.

The fifth theme deals with feeling guilty. This feeling is a downside of the reentry experience. These women felt guilty for anybody who was negatively affected by their reentry into the workplace. All participants who have a child or children expressed guilty feelings about not being able to stay at home with their children all day. Three women felt sorry for the sacrifices of their mothers who were taking care of their children. This guilt appears to come from the socially shared belief that mothers should be the sole caregivers who provide family members with comfort and full attention. They had inner conflict over their decision to go back to work when they feared that their children would be negatively affected.

Being vulnerable to the rigid workplace culture emerged as the sixth theme. Most of the workplaces in Korea are patriarchal. Goldberg (as cited in Hakim, 1996) defined patriarchy as "the overwhelming number of upper positions in hierarchies are occupied by males (p. 7). " Despite the increasing number of working women in Korea, the customs, policies, and tacit rules are intertwined for the benefit of the patriarchal organizations. When the participants confront this patriarchal culture, they feel vulnerable and powerless. As a reaction, some try to accept and adjust themselves to the rigid workplace, while other women with choices try to avoid the rigid patriarchal system and choose more liberal workplaces, such as multinational companies in Korea. All participants expressed some longing for a more flexible and egalitarian workplace, where their personal needs could be met in harmony with the organization's needs.

The last theme concerns redefining the meaning of work. Going through career interruptions and reentry experiences, all women in this study redefined their meaning of work. Some imposed the meaning of self-actualization and self-development, and some came to focus on the monetary rewards. The meaning of experience changes progressively as adults develop cognitively (Blocher, 1980). The reentry experience is recalled by the participants as adding additional meaning to work.

Limitations

It would have been instructive to hear the voices of more women. However, within the time restraints allowed for this study, only six participants who met the criteria and who were willing to participate were identified. The participants lived in Seoul, the capital of Korea. A sample of other areas might yield its own rich set of descriptions on the reentry experiences of these women as these areas are considered to be more conservative and more patriarchal.

Credibility is a concern in qualitative research. It relates to internal validity and asks how confidence in the truth of the findings of a particular inquiry can be established (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). The senior author grew up in Korea, so she is well-equipped to understand the Korean cultural context. In addition, as she has also lived in the U.S. for six years, she is able to view the Korean cultural context with a third-eye perspective. Moreover, the one-time telephone interview might not have produced quite as full a description of the reentry women's experience in Korea, compared to live, in-person interviews.

Contributions of Research to HRD

The results of the current study will contribute to the understanding of the reentry experience of Korean women after career interruptions. This study provides a rich and in-depth description about reentry women's actual values, beliefs, or attitudes, from their own voices. This research provides several implications for professionals working with reentry women, such as career counselors, adult educators, and corporate human resource developers and managers.

First, career counselors working with reentry women will benefit from the results of the current study by helping them to locate appropriate jobs and meeting reentry women's unique career counseling needs. In Korea, there are few career counseling services intended for adult women. In most cases, reentry women in Korea make significant career decisions without professional career counseling or career information. When women stay at home, they are unlikely to access appropriate career counseling. Thus, career counseling service organizations should devote more energy to outreach into the community for potential reentry women in their homes.

Second, this study provides adult educators with in-depth understanding about their potential clients—reentry women intending to return to schools. Women who wish to reenter the workplace may need help in recognizing

which skills and knowledge are outdated. They may then be willing to update themselves to regain employability via vocational training or learning. Adult vocational educators can target this reentry women population and attract them by addressing their unique needs.

This study can also help corporate human resource developers and managers who want to make use of reentry women's skills and talent. By recognizing conditions that keep women from reentering the workplace, corporate HR developers and managers should try to create more flexible and egalitarian work environments in order to increase employee job satisfaction.

Finally, many potential reentry women in Korea can benefit from this study. Because of a lack of role models for reentry women in Korea, and because of differences in individual situations, this research may provide a foundation for understanding the common thread that links reentry women's workplace experiences. By understanding reentry women's experiences, women who dream of reentering the workplace can reevaluate and successfully carry out their career plans.

References

Betz, N. E. (1987). *The career psychology of women*. Orlando, FA: Academic Press.

Blocher, D. (1980). Developmental counseling revisited. *Counseling and Human Development, 13*(4), 1-7.

Creswell, J. W. (1998). *Qualitative inquiry and research design*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Denzin, N. K., & Lincoln, Y. S. (1994). *Handbook of qualitative research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Dukes, S. (1984). Phenomenological methodology in the human sciences. *Journal of Religion and Health, 23*(3), 197-203.

Eastmond, D. V. (1991). Since Levinson: View of life cycle theory and adult education. *Journal of Adult Education, 19*, 3-10.

Even, W. (1987). Career interruptions following childbirth. *Journal of labor economic, 5*, 255-277.

Giorgi, A. (1975). An application of phenomenological method in psychology. In A. Giorgi, C. T. Fischer, & E. L. Murray (Eds.), *Duquesne studies in phenomenological psychology: Vol. 2* (pp. 72-79). Pittsburgh, PA: Duquesne University Press.

Giorgi, A. (1985). *Phenomenology and psychological research*. Pittsburgh, PA: Duquesne University Press.

Hakim, C. (1996). *Key issues in women's work*. London, England: Athlone.

Kim, J. (1999). Comparative study of women's lifelong education in the Asia-Pacific region. *Women's Studies Forum, 15*, 95-110.

Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.

McLean, G. N., & Crawford, J. S. (Eds.). (1979). *Humanity as a career: A holistic approach to sex equity*. Rehoboth, MA: Twin Oaks Publishing.

Moon, Y. K. (1998). *YeoSung SilUJjaWa ChuiUpHeeMangJaui KuJikJangWeeWa JoGun [Job searching behaviors and conditions for women unemployeds]*. Seoul, Korea: Institute of Korean Women's Development.

Padula, M. A. (1994). Reentry women: A literature review with recommendations for counseling and research. *Journal of Counseling & Development, 73*, 10-73.

Petersen, R. P. (1991). Reentry women: Implications for adult education. *The Delta Kappa Gamma Bulletin, 28*, 41-46.

Polkinghorne, D. E. (1989). Phenomenological research methods. In R. S. Valle & S. Halling (Eds.), *Existential-phenomenological perspectives in psychology* (pp.41-60). New York, NY: Plenum.

Santrock, J. W. (1994). *Life-span development*. Dubuque, IA: W. C. Brown.

van Manen, M. (1990). *Researching lived experience: Human science for an action sensitive pedagogy*. New York, NY: The State University of New York.

Watkins, K. E. (1988). Supporting women's reentry to the workplace. In L. H. Lewis (Ed.), *New directions for continuing education, 39: Addressing the needs of returning women* (pp. 49-64). San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

U.S. Department of Education
Office of Educational Research and Improvement (OERI)
National Library of Education (NLE)
Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC)

REPRODUCTION RELEASE

(Specific Document)

I. DOCUMENT IDENTIFICATION:

Title: 2002 AHRD Conference Proceedings	
Author(s): Toby marshall Egan & Susan A. Lynham	
Corporate Source: Academy of Human Resource Development	Publication Date: February 2002

II. REPRODUCTION RELEASE:

In order to disseminate as widely as possible timely and significant materials of interest to the educational community, documents announced in the monthly abstract journal of the ERIC system, *Resources in Education* (RIE), are usually made available to users in microfiche, reproduced paper copy, and electronic media, and sold through the ERIC Document Reproduction Service (EDRS). Credit is given to the source of each document, and, if reproduction release is granted, one of the following notices is affixed to the document.

If permission is granted to reproduce and disseminate the identified document, please CHECK ONE of the following three options and sign at the bottom of the page.

The sample sticker shown below will be affixed to all Level 1 documents

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Sample

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

1

Level 1

☒

Check here for Level 1 release, permitting reproduction and dissemination in microfiche or other ERIC archive media (e.g., electronic) and paper copy.

The sample sticker shown below will be affixed to all Level 2A documents

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL IN MICROFICHE, AND IN ELECTRONIC MEDIA FOR ERIC COLLECTION SUBSCRIBERS ONLY, HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Sample

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

2A

Level 2A

☐

Check here for Level 2A release, permitting reproduction and dissemination in microfiche and in electronic media for ERIC archival collection subscribers only

The sample sticker shown below will be affixed to all Level 2B documents

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL IN MICROFICHE ONLY HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Sample

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

2B

Level 2B

☐

Check here for Level 2B release, permitting reproduction and dissemination in microfiche only

Documents will be processed as indicated provided reproduction quality permits.
If permission to reproduce is granted, but no box is checked, documents will be processed at Level 1.

I hereby grant to the Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC) nonexclusive permission to reproduce and disseminate this document as indicated above. Reproduction from the ERIC microfiche or electronic media by persons other than ERIC employees and its system contractors requires permission from the copyright holder. Exception is made for non-profit reproduction by libraries and other service agencies to satisfy information needs of educators in response to discrete inquiries.

Sign here, → please

Signature: Kathryn S. Egan

Printed Name/Position/Title:

Organization/Address: Academy of Human Resource Development
College of Technology
Bowling Green State University
Bowling Green, OH 43403-0301

Telephone: 419.372.9155 FAX: 419.372.8385

E-Mail Address: office@ahrd.org Date: 2-28-03

(over)

09/12/2003 08:27 FAX 6142921260 OSU CTR EDUC & TRNG EMPL 002

III. DOCUMENT AVAILABILITY INFORMATION (FROM NON-ERIC SOURCE):

If permission to reproduce is not granted to ERIC, or, if you wish ERIC to cite the availability of the document from another source, please provide the following information regarding the availability of the document. (ERIC will not announce a document unless it is publicly available, and a dependable source can be specified. Contributors should also be aware that ERIC selection criteria are significantly more stringent for documents that cannot be made available through EDRS.)

Publisher/Distributor:
Address:
Price:

IV. REFERRAL OF ERIC TO COPYRIGHT/REPRODUCTION RIGHTS HOLDER:

If the right to grant this reproduction release is held by someone other than the addressee, please provide the appropriate name and address:

Name:
Address:

V. WHERE TO SEND THIS FORM:

Send this form to the following ERIC Clearinghouse:

Acquisitions Coordinator
ERIC Clearinghouse on Adult, Career, and Vocational Education
Center on Education and Training for Employment
1900 Kenny Road
Columbus, OH 43210-1090

However, if solicited by the ERIC Facility, or if making an unsolicited contribution to ERIC, return this form (and the document being contributed) to:

09/12/2003 08:27 FAX 6142921260 OSU CTR EDUC & TRNG EMPL 003